# MAY 2008

# ORAL ARGUMENT

## CALENDAR

#### MAY, 2008

### May 7, 2008

9:00 – 9:15 A.M., SHOW CAUSE HEARING, 2006-CA-001682, MARK LIBRETTO V. KIM KINNAIRD, JUDGE ACREE, PRES., JUDGE NICKELL AND JUDGE VANMETER, ASSOC.

### 10:00 A.M. COURT MEETING

1:30 – 2:10 P.M., ORAL ARGUMENT, 2006-CA-001087, PAUL ROGERS V. SCARLETT COUNTS, JUDGE WINE, PRES., JUDGE KELLER AND JUDGE THOMPSON, ASSOC.

2:15 – 2:45 P.M., ORAL ARGUMENT, 2007-CA-001042, TONYA FARMER DEROSSETT V. GERTRUDE TYSON, SR. JUDGE BUCKINGHAM, PRES., JUDGE LAMBERT AND JUDGE TAYLOR, ASSOC.

2:30 P.M., MOTION PANEL, JUDGE THOMPSON, PRES., JUDGE CAPERTON, AND JUDGE KELLER, ASSOC.

3:00 – 3:30 P.M., ORAL ARGUMENT, 2006-CA-002119 & 2006-CA-002143, ROY HAMM V. DIANA HAMM, JUDGE TAYLOR, PRES., JUDGE LAMBERT AND SR. JUDGE BUCKINGHAM, ASSOC.

3:45 – 4:15 P.M., ORAL ARGUMENT, 2006-CA-002624 & 2007-CA-000444, VANDANA KUMAT V. ASHUTOSH LOHE, JUDGE STUMBO, PRES., CHIEF JUDGE COMBS AND SR. JUDGE KNOPF, ASSOC.

PHONE NUMBERS WHERE PANEL MEMBERS CAN BE REACHED WHEN ORAL ARGUMENTS SCHEDULED:

FRANKFORT – Contact Mary Zagale - (502) 573-7920 CARROLLTON – Contact Susan Caldon – (502) 732-4305 PADUCAH – Contact Vicky Potts – (270) 575-7400 PRESTONSBURG – Contact Karen Caudill (606) 889-1900

Report Updated On: 04/29/2008

LOCATION: COURT OF APPEALS COURTROOM, 360 DEMOCRAT DRIVE,

FRANKFORT, KENTUCKY

DATE: Monday, May 05, 2008

10:00 AM PJ: WINE CAPERTON KELLER 2007CA000136 DAVID TIDWELL, IV VS COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

Appeal from conviction for TBUT over \$300 and PFO II. Denial of motion for directed verdict; denial of lesser-included offense instruction; violation of separation of witness order; denial of motion to suppress evidence seized pursuant to search warrant; denial of motion to suppress photographs and witness identification as unduly suggestive; impeachment of defense witness on collateral matter; cumulative error.

CRIMINAL PIKE COUNTY EDDY COLEMAN

Appellant Atty: Appellant Name:

DOTTED CAMUEL N

POTTER, SAMUEL N DAVID TIDWELL, IV SCHMIDT, KATHLEEN K. DAVID TIDWELL, IV

Appellee Atty: Appellee Name:

HARNED, MICHAEL L. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MOORE, JASON B. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

\*\*NOTE:ORIGINALLY ON 4/25/08 AT 1:30 PM IN COVINGTON, KY

10:45 AM PJ: WINE CAPERTON KELLER

2007CA000301 GEORGE GLASS VS NANCY GLASS

2007CA000368 Appeal and cross-appeal from dissolution judgment. Direct appeal: Classification of non-marital property; burden of proof to

show that increase in value of non-marital property remains non-marital; and division of marital property. Cross-appeal: classification of a ring which replaced a gifted ring as marital; sufficiency of evidence of value of another ring used to offset

ring; existence of agreement regarding disposition of rings.

CIVIL FAYETTE COUNTY KIMBERLY N BUNNELL

Appellant Atty: Appellant Name:

DEVINE, CARL D. GEORGE REID GLASS
SALSMAN, MICAH EDWARD GEORGE REID GLASS

Appellee Atty: Appellee Name:

OSBORNE, CRYSTAL L. NANCY ELLIS GLASS

<sup>\*\*</sup>NOTE:ORIGINALLY ON 4/25/08 AT 2:15 PM IN COVINGTON, KY.

FRANKFORT, KENTUCKY

DATE: Monday, May 05, 2008

11:30 AM PJ: WINE CAPERTON KELLER

2007CA001087 JAMES BROOKS ET AL. VS GRAMS, INC.

Appeal from summary judgment dismissing vicarious liability claim. Whether the spouse of an employee who is running a work-related errand for the employee has an agency relationship with employer. Existence of genuine issues of material fact.

CIVIL LINCOLN COUNTY JEFFREY T BURDETTE

Appellant Atty: Appellant Name:

.....

DEAN, JAMES HADDEN JAMES BROOKS
ROBIN BROOKS

Appellee Atty: Appellee Name:

GREENE, ANGELA LOU GRAMS, INC.

<sup>\*\*</sup>NOTE:40 MINUTE ORAL - ORIGINALLY ON 4/25/08 AT 3:00 PM

FRANKFORT, KENTUCKY

DATE: Tuesday, May 06, 2008

......

10:00 AM PJ: KELLER CAPERTON WINE

2007CA001075 ZOEY YOUNG VS UNIVERSITY HOSPITAL OF THE ALBERT B. CHANDLER

MED. CTR. INC. ET AL.

In this medical negligence action, the circuit court dismissed defendant medical center on the basis of sovereign immunity.

Appellant alleges the defendants were not entitled to said immunity protection.

CIVIL FAYETTE COUNTY PAMELA R GOODWINE

Appellant Atty: Appellant Name:

SHEPHERD, LIZ J ZOEY MCKENZY YOUNG
SMITH II, DANIEL TYSEN ZOEY MCKENZY YOUNG
THOMPSON, TYLER S ZOEY MCKENZY YOUNG

Appellee Atty: Appellee Name:

.....

KINKEL, STEVEN G UNIVERSITY HOSPITAL OF THE ALBERT B. CHANDLER MED. CTR. INC.

UNIVERSITY OF KENTUCKY MEDICAL CENTER

MARRS, MELANIE S. UNIVERSITY HOSPITAL OF THE ALBERT B. CHANDLER MED. CTR. INC.

UNIVERSITY OF KENTUCKY MEDICAL CENTER

TREVEY, DAVID ANDREW UNIVERSITY HOSPITAL OF THE ALBERT B. CHANDLER MED. CTR. INC.

UNIVERSITY OF KENTUCKY MEDICAL CENTER

<sup>\*\*</sup>NOTE:ORIGINALLY ON 4/24/08 AT 4:00 PM IN COVINGTON, KY

FRANKFORT, KENTUCKY DATE: Tuesday, May 06, 2008 10:45 AM PJ: KELLER **CAPERTON** WINE S.M., A CHILD UNDER EIGHTEEN VS COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY 2007CA001353 This appeal involves the circuit court's opinion affirming the district court's ruling that the appellant, a juvenile, who was allegedly not eligible to be declared a juvenile sexual offender due to conviction for two counts of voyeurism was not entitled to an independent sexual assessment. **FAYETTE COUNTY** DR CRIMINAL DAVID HAYSE Appellant Atty: Appellant Name: ...... ROBINSON, GAIL S.M., A CHILD UNDER EIGHTEEN SCHMIDT, KATHLEEN K. S.M., A CHILD UNDER EIGHTEEN Appellee Atty: Appellee Name: CONWAY, JACK COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MINNIFIELD, DIANE T COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY \*\*NOTE:ORIGINALLY ON 4/25/08 AT 11:00 AM IN COVINGTON, KY Page 4 of 14 

LOCATION: COURT OF APPEALS COURTROOM, 360 DEMOCRAT DRIVE,

FRANKFORT, KENTUCKY

DATE: Tuesday, May 06, 2008

.....

11:30 AM PJ: KELLER CAPERTON WINE 2007CA000203 DOUGLAS FULTZ VS COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

The appellant is alleging six points of error in this appeal from a Manslaughter in the Second Degree verdict. They include

juror tainting as well as sufficiency of the evidence.

CRIMINAL MCLEAN COUNTY DAVID H JERNIGAN

Appellant Atty: Appellant Name:

PEARSON, JULIA K. DOUGLAS R. FULTZ SCHMIDT, KATHLEEN K. DOUGLAS R. FULTZ

Appellee Atty: Appellee Name:

.....

CONWAY, JACK COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY
RYAN, PERRY T COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

<sup>\*\*</sup>NOTE:ORIGINALLY ON 4/25/08 AT 10:15 AM IN COVINGTON, KY

FRANKFORT, KENTUCKY DATE: Wednesday, May 07, 2008

9:00 AM PJ: ACREE NICKELL VANMETER

2006CA001682 MARK LIBRETTO VS KIM KINNAIRD

CIVIL BOONE COUNTY PAUL W. ROSENBLUM

Appellant Atty: Appellant Name:

.....

HOUSE, JULIETTE STEWART MARK LIBRETTO

Appellee Atty: Appellee Name:

.....

STEELE, DAVID R KIM KINNAIRD

\*\*NOTE:SHOW CAUSE HEARING

1:30 PM PJ: WINE KELLER THOMPSON

2006CA001087 PAUL ROGERS ET AL. VS SCARLETT COUNTS ET AL.

Rogers appeal from a jury verdict awarding them no damages for personal injuries in a motor vehicle accident. Sufficiency of evidence; denial of motion for new trial; exclusion of evidence involving insurer while allowing insurer to participate at trial as a party; trial court's denial of request for additional cross-examination of medical witness testimony admitted by video

deposition; preservation issues.

CIVIL PIKE COUNTY STEVEN D. COMBS

Appellant Atty: Appellant Name:

.....

PAUL RODNEY ROGERS

STEVENS, JONAH LEE BARBARA ROGERS

PAUL RODNEY ROGERS

BARBARA ROGERS

Appellee Atty: Appellee Name:

......

SMITH, LEE A SCARLETT RAE COUNTS

SPURGEON, SANDRA GEICO INSURANCE COMPANY

\*\*NOTE:40 MINUTE ORAL

HAMILTON, JAMES L

FRANKFORT, KENTUCKY DATE: Wednesday, May 07, 2008

2:15 PM **TAYLOR** PJ: BUCKINGHAM **LAMBERT** 2007CA001042 TONYA DEROSSETT VS GERTRUDE TYSON Property damage. CIVIL FLOYD COUNTY DANNY P CAUDILL Appellant Atty: Appellant Name: WEBSTER, LAWRENCE R. TONYA FARMER DEROSSETT Appellee Atty: Appellee Name: ...... PATTON, JERRY A. GERTRUDE TYSON \*\*NOTE:ORIGINALLY 4/16/08 AT 1:30 PM 3:00 PM PJ: TAYLOR **LAMBERT BUCKINGHAM** 2006CA002119 ROY HAMM VS DIANA HAMM 2006-CA-002119 - Whether circuit court erred in its division of marital property; 2006-CA-002143 -Whether circuit court erred 2006CA002143 by not awarding permanent maintenance. CIVIL PULASKI COUNTY JEFFREY T BURDETTE Appellant Atty: Appellant Name: MCENROE, CHARLES J. ROY G. HAMM Appellee Atty: Appellee Name: BAKER, ROBERT R DIANA E. HAMM 3:45 PM PJ: STUMBO **COMBS KNOPF** VANDANA KUMAT VS ASHUTOSH LOHE 2006CA002624 Appeals from dissolution of marriage; issues include division of marital property, maintenance, failure to award childcare 2007CA000444 expenses CIVIL KNOX COUNTY **GREGORY A. LAY** Appellant Atty: Appellant Name: ...... CHUN, SUSAN Y.W. VANDANA KUMAT DEVINE, CARL D. VANDANA KUMAT

Appellee Atty:

......

DAWAHARE, SANDRA MENDEZ

ASHUTOSH LOHE

Appellee Name:

......

<sup>\*\*</sup>NOTE:ORIGINALLY ON 5/14/08 AT 1:00 PM IN PRESTONSBURG, KY

LOCATION: CARROLL COUNTY COURTHOUSE, HALL OF JUSTICE, 802 CLAY

STREET, CARROLLTON, KENTUCKY

DATE: Monday, May 12, 2008

......

1:00 PM

PJ: KELLER

THOMPSON

**GRAVES** 

2007CA000089

MITZI WYRICK VS DEPARTMENT OF REVENUE, FINANCE &

ADMINISTRATION CABINET ET AL.

This case originated as an Open Records action in Franklin Circuit Court which upheld the appellees invocation of KRS 61.878(1) which addresses access to materials pertaining to civil litigation to deny appellant's Open Records request. The appellees alleged that this is actually a discovery dispute masquerading as an Open Records request case.

.....

CIVIL FRANKLIN COUNTY SAM G. MCNAMARA

Appellant Atty: Appellant Name:

BASHA, RANIA MARIE MITZI D. WYRICK
PATTERSON, DEBORAH H MITZI D. WYRICK
RAINES, KATHRYNE B MITZI D. WYRICK

Appellee Atty: Appellee Name:

.....

ADAMS, MICHAEL GENE DEPARTMENT OF REVENUE, FINANCE & ADMINISTRATION CABINET

MARIAN DAVIS

FERGUSON, LAURA M DEPARTMENT OF REVENUE, FINANCE & ADMINISTRATION CABINET

MARIAN DAVIS

TROWER, C. CHRISTOPHER DEPARTMENT OF REVENUE, FINANCE & ADMINISTRATION CABINET

MARIAN DAVIS

1:45 PM

PJ: KELLER

THOMPSON

**GRAVES** 

2007CA002609

CLARENCE HICKS VS R & J WELL SERVICE ET AL.

Petition for Review filed by Clarence Hicks who sustained an injury on August 18, 2006, when he was lifting a large well head weighing 150 pounds. The Workers' Compensation Board's opinion dated 11-30-07 affirmed the ALJ's opinion dated 7-20-07 dismissing the claims. The ALJ found no work-related injury; failed to apportion any active impairment; and denied requested surgery.

WORKERS COMP

WORKERS' COMP COUNTY

FRANKLIN STIVERS

Appellant Atty: Appellant Name:

MOAK, THOMAS W CLARENCE HICKS

Appellee Atty: Appellee Name:

.....

DAVIS, MARC CHRISTOPHER CHRIS DAVIS
HERALD III, JAMES WILLIAM R & J WELL SERVICE

LOVAN, DWIGHT T. WORKERS' COMPENSATION BOARD

LOCATION: CARROLL COUNTY COURTHOUSE, HALL OF JUSTICE, 802 CLAY

STREET, CARROLLTON, KENTUCKY

DATE: Tuesday, May 13, 2008

10:00 AM PJ: THOMPSON KELLER GRAVES 2007CA000455 GREGORY DILLMAN VS COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

Appellant was convicted in trial by jury of trafficking in a controlled substance. During cross examination, appellant alleges he was questioned about prior bad acts. Appellant asserted a fifth amendment right. Trial ct ordered appellant to answer question. Appellant complains prosecution did not give notice pursuant to KRE 404 © of intention to introduce evidence of other crimes, wrongs or acts, and of violation fifth amendment rights. Alleges trial ct. improperly instructed jury to law of case.

CRIMINAL PULASKI COUNTY DAVID A. TAPP

Appellant Atty: Appellant Name:

BUCK, STEVEN JARED GREGORY DILLMAN SCHMIDT, KATHLEEN K. GREGORY DILLMAN

Appellee Atty: Appellee Name:

.....

CONWAY, JACK COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MAXSON, JAMES CHESNUT COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

10:45 AM PJ: THOMPSON KELLER GRAVES 2007CA001348 EDDIE ROTHWELL VS E. SINGLETON ET AL.

Appellant appeals a directed verdict during a jury trial of a will contest action. Appellant believes that sufficient evidence was introduced during its case in chief so as to compel that this litigation be decided by the jury.

CIVIL LINCOLN COUNTY DAVID A. TAPP

Appellant Atty: Appellant Name:

SHORT, FREDERICK EDDIE S. ROTHWELL SR

Appellee Atty: Appellee Name:

DAY, DARYL KEVIN E. ELOISE SINGLETON

E. ELOISE SINGLETON

HELTON, EPHRAIM WOODS E. ELOISE SINGLETON

E. ELOISE SINGLETON

LOCATION: CARROLL COUNTY COURTHOUSE, HALL OF JUSTICE, 802 CLAY

STREET, CARROLLTON, KENTUCKY

DATE: Tuesday, May 13, 2008

11:30 AM

PJ: THOMPSON

**KELLER** 

**GRAVES** 

2007CA001444

Z. T. VS M. T. ET AL.

Issues: Finding of dependency, neglect and abuse, and ordered that he have no contact with his children; When 6 yr old child was questioned by county atty, the judge ordered him to remain outside of room and view proceedings on closed circuit TV and communicate with his atty by way of microphone connected to earphones worn by his atty; Alleges Mother had affair with pastor for one yr and had sexual relations with him in her home and children were in the home.

#### **KENTON COUNTY**

CHRISTOPHER J. MEHLING

Appellant Atty:	Appellant Name:
BATHALTER, ROBERT	Z. T.
Appellee Atty:	Appellee Name:
EASTERLING, KENNETH L	CABINET FOR HEALTH & FAMILY SERVICES
HAAS JR, MARTIN	M. T.
MCCRACKEN, KAREN E	A. T.
THOMPSON, GEORGE ANDREW	KENTUCKY COUNTY ATTORNEY

WILEY, KELLY SENSEL CABINET FOR HEALTH & FAMILY SERVICES

FRANKFORT, KENTUCKY

DATE: Tuesday, May 13, 2008

10:00 AM

PJ: WINE

ACREE

**VANMETER** 

2007CA001174

PEOPLES BANK OF NORTHERN KENTUCKY, INC. ET AL. VS CROWE CHIZEK AND COMPANY LLC ET AL.

Bank appeals from 6 orders entered by trial court without opinion or discussion, which had effect of granting summary judgment and dismissing each of bank's claims. Issues: Court ignored Steelvest standard, statute of limitations was tolled, claim for aiding and abetting, punitive damages, discovery, an alleged "release", jury instruction, waiver provision of audit engagement letter, and bank's check conversion losses.

CIVIL BOONE COUNTY CRAIG Z CLYMER

Appellant Atty: Appellant Name: ...... ...... PARRY, RON PBNK, INC. PEOPLES BANK OF NORTHERN KENTUCKY, INC. Appellee Atty: Appellee Name: ...... ...... CROWE CHIZEK AND COMPANY LLC KINSER, HENRY E. WILLIAM, B. BRIZENDINE CROWE CHIZEK AND COMPANY LLC KONIECZNY, DANIEL I WILLIAM, B. BRIZENDINE PATTON, JON JEFFREY CROWE CHIZEK AND COMPANY LLC WILLIAM, B. BRIZENDINE PRIOR, GARY L. CROWE CHIZEK AND COMPANY LLC

WILLIAM. B. BRIZENDINE

WEBSTER, MICKEY TODD CROWE CHIZEK AND COMPANY LLC

WILLIAM, B. BRIZENDINE

<sup>\*\*</sup>NOTE:40 MINUTE ORAL ORIGINALLY ON 5/06/08 AT 1:30 PM

LOCATION: FLOYD COUNTY JUSTICE CENTER, CIRCUIT COURTROOM B, 127

SOUTH LAKE DRIVE, PRESTONSBURG, KENTUCKY

DATE: Wednesday, May 14, 2008

1:45 PM PJ: COMBS STUMBO KNOPF

2007CA000978 LORRAINE MAY VS JAY MOORE

Appellant challenges summary judgment against her in a case involving personal injury to her allegedly resulting from

negligently made repairs to a house that she was leasing.

CIVIL ROWAN COUNTY WILLIAM B MAINS

Appellant Atty: Appellant Name:

MCDONNER, MICHAEL RAY LORRAINE MAY STRITE, DAVID S. LORRAINE MAY

Appellee Atty: Appellee Name:

JAY MOORE

ELLIS, JOHN J. JAY MOORE

STOKES, PAUL R.

2:30 PM PJ: COMBS STUMBO KNOPF

2007CA001728 AMBER EVANS VS VICKY EVANS ET AL.

Appellant, natural mother of three children at issue, challenges grant of custody to their paternal grandparents even though a

judicial decree had previously found her to be a fit custodian.

CIVIL BELL COUNTY JAMES L BOWLING JR

Appellant Atty: Appellant Name:

.....

TAYLOR, MICHAEL A AMBER NICOLE EVANS

Appellee Atty: Appellee Name:

.....

WEBSTER, SCOTT M. MIKE R. EVANS

MIKE R. EVANS II VICKY EVANS

FRANKFORT, KENTUCKY DATE: Wednesday, May 21, 2008

10:30 AM PJ: KNOPF STUMBO TAYLOR

2008CA000046 COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY VS GREGORY BARTLETT ET AL.

WRIT OF PROHIBITION COUNTY

Appellant Atty: Appellant Name:

ABDRABBO, SHARIF AHMED COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY
CONWAY, JACK COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY
CRAWFORD, RONALD W. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

Appellee Atty: Appellee Name:

BARTLETT, GREGORY M. GREGORY M. BARTLETT

DAVIDSON, DAVID E SANDRA D. YOUNG
HUMMEL, MICHAEL ANDREW JONATHAN COX
LOTZ JR, W ROBERT LARRY COLE

11:15 AM PJ: KNOPF STUMBO TAYLOR 2008CA000027 COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY VS A.C. CHAUVIN ET AL.

WRIT OF PROHIBITION COUNTY

.......

Appellant Atty: Appellant Name:

OVERCASH, WENDELL H. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

Appellee Atty: Appellee Name:

CHAUVIN, A. C. MCKAY

A.C. MCKAY CHAUVIN

KOEHLER III, WILLIAM PHILIP

LOGSDON, ERIN CATHERINE

O'BRIEN, KENNETH P.

CHRISTOPHER WARNER

CHRISTOPHER WARNER

LOCATION: MCCRACKEN COUNTY COURTHOUSE, COURTROOM A, SECOND

FLOOR, 301 SOUTH SIXTH STREET, PADUCAH, KENTUCKY

DATE: Thursday, May 29, 2008

1:30 PM PJ: TAYLOR CLAYTON NICKELL

2007CA001732 DICKIE TODD VS CITY OF PADUCAH

Whether circuit court properly concluded City of Paducah's smoking ban ordinance did not constitute zoning ordinance under

KRS 100.203.

.....

CIVIL MCCRACKEN COUNTY ROBERT J. HINES

Appellant Atty: Appellant Name:

LONG, KEVIN A. DICKIE TODD SMITH, JEREMY IAN DICKIE TODD

Appellee Atty: Appellee Name:

.....

KELLY, DAVID L. CITY OF PADUCAH YATES, MELISSA KERLEY CITY OF PADUCAH